An Environmental Scan of OCLC Alternatives

Report Prepared for RAILS

Prepared by
JRM Consulting, Inc.
April 2015

Agenda

- Introduction
- About OCLC
- Exploring Alternatives
- Cataloging Alternatives
- Interlibrary Loan Alternatives
- Recommendations

Introduction

- Bergen County Cooperative Library System (NJ)
- Colorado Alliance of Research Libraries – CARL
- Lakeland Library Cooperative (MI)
- MOBIUS (MO)
- SAILS Library Network (MA)
- MINERVA (ME)

- Black Gold Cooperative Library Network (CA)
- Colorado Library Consortium – CLiC
- The Library Network (MI)
- OWLSnet Public Library System (WI)
- Libraries of Middlesex Automation Consortium (NJ)
- Washington Idaho Network (WA)
- Library Services Centre (Ontario, Canada)

About OCLC

- WorldShare Metadata Services (cataloging)
- WorldShare Interlibrary Loan (sharing resources)
- WorldShare Management Services (cloud-based integrated library system)
- WorldCat Discovery Services
- CONTENTdm (manage digital collections)

About OCLC

- 16,857 members in 113 countries
- WorldCat has 321 million bibliographic records
- Illinois libraries have contributed 89 million holdings
- Revenues were $213,575,500 in 2014
- Reserves of $266,911,900 in 2014

About OCLC

- OCLC costs of $4.2 million to be allocated among Illinois libraries
- Costs allocated based on historical use of OCLC services
- Lack of transparency and equality in pricing using the existing process
- In some cases, costs of OCLC are equal to or exceed membership charges in a shared ILS consortia

Exploring Alternatives

- Breadth– size & diversity of the database
- Quality – adherence to standards, duplicate records
- Ease of Use – User interface to accomplish tasks
- Costs of Use

Cataloging Alternatives

- Online Access, such as SkyRiver
- Other libraries, using Z39.50
- Internet resources
- Vendors that supply physical and electronic resources
- Outsourcing cataloging vendors

Online Access

- SkyRiver
  - Breadth – 70 million records
  - Quality – Good
  - Ease of Use – Excellent
  - Costs – Low and no per record charge

SkyRiver Costs

Consortium	Costs	Records/Year	Cost/Record
Black Gold Cooperative	$16,500	9,000	$1.83
Four County Lib. System	15,000	12,500	1.20
Lakeland Lib. Cooperative	49,500	35,747	1.38
Lakeshores Library System	36,500	30,000	1.22
The Library Network	42,250	50,000	.85
OWLSnet Public Lib. Sys.	40,000	100,000	.40
SAILS Library Network	38,696	52,462	.73
Suffolk County Lib. Coop.		90,000	
AVERAGE*	$34,064	41,387	$.82

* Ignoring Suffolk County

Other Libraries

- Z39.50
  - Breadth – Quite large
  - Quality – Good
  - Ease of Use – Easy but time consuming (in some cases)
  - Costs - Staff

Internet Resources

- Social Cataloging Sites
  - Breadth – Large
  - Quality – Mixed – short records
  - Ease of Use – Time consuming
  - Costs - Staff

Material Vendors

- Suppliers
  - Breadth – Good
  - Quality – Mixed (Mostly good)
  - Ease of Use – Batch loading, duplicates
  - Costs - Staff

Material Vendors

Vendor	Size of DB	Cost of Copy Cataloging	Cost of Original Cataloging
Baker & Taylor	10 million	40 cents	AV edited = $1.50
Brodart	15 million	$1.25	$4.00
Ingram	17 million	40 cents	$10 to $12
Midwest Tapes	??	0 to $1.20	$10 to $12
OverDrive	??	0 to $1.50	Not available

Outsourcing Vendors

- Library Services Centre
  - Breadth – Moderate (current materials)
  - Quality – High (authority control)
  - Ease of Use – Simple
  - Costs – Low (batch loading)

Comparison of Cataloging Alternatives

Option	Source of Records	Size of DB	Quality	Cost per Record
SkyRiver	LC +	70+ million	High	Varies – 82 cents
Other libraries	LC + others	75+ million	High	Free
Internet resources	Members & libraries (LC)	100+ million	Mixed	Free
Material vendors	LC & publishers	17 million or less	High generally	40 cents to $4
Outsourcing	LC, other libraries	1.5 million	High – authority control	$1 to $3.75

Interlibrary Loan Alternatives

- Messaging software
- Reduce the number of ILSs – merge consortia and grow membership in remaining consortia
- Create a RAILS regional catalog/ILL system (overlay project)

Comparison of ILL Alternatives

State	Annual Cost of Operation	Number of Fulfilled ILL Requests Last Year	Cost per Fulfilled ILL Request
Colorado – INN-Reach	$ 175,000	600,000	$ .29
Connecticut - SHAREit	513,916	128,384	4.00
Kansas - SHAREit	448,452	123,447	3.63
Louisiana - SHAREit	135,000	85,000	1.59
	125,000*	11,000*	11.36*
Maryland – Relais	69,785	285,107	.25
Michigan – INN-Reach	450,000	1,096,689	.41
Mississippi - SHAREit	54,000	14,521	3.72
Montana – SirsiDynix	219,919	231,343	.95
New Jersey - SHAREit	483,000	130,310	3.71
Wisconsin - SHAREit	386,250	179,966	2.15
Br Columbia – SHAREit	118,000	107,163	1.10
INN-Reach Averages	$ 312,500	848,345	$ .37
Relais Averages s	$ 69,785	285,107	$ .25
SHAREit Averages	$ 305,517	109,827	$ 2.78

* = Data for OCLC   # = Only 1 library

Implications

- Significant cost savings by embracing one or more cataloging and ILL alternatives

- Accuracy of holdings in RAILS member libraries in OCLC will decline over time

- RAILS member libraries will have more fiscal and administrative control over the way services are delivered

Recommendations

- Investigate a SkyRiver Master Agreement
- Create a Cataloging Center
- Create a RAILS Regional Catalog/ILL System (overlay project)
- Make the RAILS Regional Catalog Discoverable
- Encourage Libraries to Evaluate the Purchasing of Materials in Lieu of Using ILL
- Periodically Offer a Webinar on Cataloging Alternatives

Over To You

- Joe AT JoeMatthews.Org